Digital democracy

Digital democracy – the collective use of information and communication technology for practices of politics and democracy in both online and offline environments (van Dijk & Hacker 2018).

Aspects of digital democracy

Transparency: the publication of all government-held information (as opposed to only information on government activities); proactive or reactive releases of information; mechanisms to strengthen the right to information; and open access to government information (OGP 2020).

Accountability: rules, regulations, and mechanisms in place that call upon government actors to justify their actions, act upon criticisms or requirements made of them, and accept responsibility for failure to perform with respect to laws or commitments. Commitments on accountability should typically include an outward-facing component (i.e., they are not solely accountable to internal systems, but also involve the public) (OGP 2020).

Participation: governments seek to engage citizens in a dialogue on public policies or programs, and request their input, feedback, and contributions, which lead to more responsive, innovative, and effective governance (OGP 2020).

Civic education: a process of learning to think about one’s life as a citizen in a community and cultivating the knowledge and skills needed to act as such (UNESCO 2009).

Stages of policy cycle

Policy. Traditional approaches to policy analysis often assume that policy can be explained in terms of the interests of rational and resourceful actors and the institutional rules, norms, and procedures that constrain the choice of rational actors. Discourse models of policy tend to define institutions not only as a recursively validated system of regulative and normative constraints but also as a broad set of values, symbols, rituals, forms of knowledge, codes, and vocabularies that facilitate and guide action. (Cheung 2011).

Policy cycle refers to the process whereby political actors attempt to shape the definition of problems, the setting of a policy agenda, the formulation of policy alternatives, the adoption and implementation of policy decisions, and the evaluation of policy outcomes (Cheung 2011).

Agenda setting refers to the first stage in the process when a problem is initially sensed by policy actors and a variety of solutions put forward (Howlett & Giest 2015).

Policy formulation refers to the development of specific policy options within government when the range of possible choices is narrowed by excluding infeasible ones and efforts are made by various actors to have their favoured solution ranked highly among the remaining few (Howlett & Giest 2015).

Decision making refers to the third stage in which formal actors in government adopt a particular course of action (Howlett & Giest 2015).

Policy implementation refers to the fourth stage when governments put their decisions into effect using some combination of the tools of public administration in order to alter the distribution of goods and services in society in a way that is broadly compatible with the sentiments and values of affected parties (Howlett & Giest 2015).

Policy evaluation refers to the fifth stage in the processes in which the results of policies are monitored by both state and societal actors, often leading to the reconceptualization of policy problems and solutions in the light of experiences encountered with the policy in question and the start of a new iteration of the cycle (Howlett & Giest 2015).
Types of digital democracy instruments by aspects and stages

- **Education**

  **Text content** – civic education online resources in text format (Khutkyy 2020).

  **Audio podcasts** – civic education online resources in audio format (Khutkyy 2020).

  **Video materials** – civic education online resources in video format (Khutkyy 2020).

  **Online course** – a civic education online resource comprised of structured online resources in text, audio, and/or video formats and homework assignments (Khutkyy 2020).

  **E-game** – a civic education online resource in game or simulation format (Khutkyy 2020).

  **Unified educational portal** – a website containing two or more civic education tools (Khutkyy 2020).

- **Transparency**

  **Basic public information website** – a website displaying basic public information, such as a public agency description, directory of public officials with contact details, news etc. (Khutkyy 2020).

  **Sectoral public information website** – a website presenting public information on a particular policy area, such as finances (Khutkyy 2020).

  **Legislation database** – a website containing a comprehensive database of legislation of a state, including laws, decrees, regulations etc. (Khutkyy 2020).

  **Open data portal** – a website containing public data in open format, such as text, structured, graphic, video, audio, flash, geospatial, and archived data (Khutkyy 2020).

  **Geospatial portal** – a website representing a geoinformation system of a country (Khutkyy 2020).

  **Unified transparency portal** – a website containing two or more transparency websites or portals (Khutkyy 2020).

- **Participation (agenda setting)**

  **Online media analytics** – a semi- or fully automated analytics of public opinion on prospective policy issues (Khutkyy 2020).

  **Idea maps** – an interactive tool for structuring and visualising sets of issues or and solutions on prospective policy issues (Khutkyy 2020).

  **E-initiative.** Using electronic and Internet tools to establish initiatives by citizens in order to participate in or influence political decision-making and engage in political agenda setting (Krimmer & Kripp 2009).

  **E-campaign.** Engaging in a co-ordinated way, by electronic means, with people and encouraging people to engage with each other in order to mobilise and/or convince individuals in political campaigns to promote cause (Krimmer & Kripp 2009).

- **Participation (policy drafting)**

  **E-petition.** Electronic delivery of a protest or recommendation to a democratic institution about a public institution, a law, or to provide the public authorities or representatives with their opinion (Krimmer & Kripp 2009).

  **E-deliberation.** Discussions of issues of citizens’ concern among citizens, public authorities and others using ICTs and other e-democracy tools in order to foster citizens’ deliberation and participation in democracy (adapted from Krimmer & Kripp 2009).

  **E-consultation.** Collecting opinions of designated persons or the public at large on a specific policy issue without necessarily mandating the decision maker (Krimmer & Kripp 2009).
E-drafting. Using ICT for drafting, commenting upon, consulting, structuring, formatting, submitting, amending, and publishing of acts of elected assemblies (adapted from Krimmer & Kripp 2009).

- Participation (decision making)

E-polling – a non-binding electronic casting a vote for a policy (Khutkyy 2020).

E-voting – a binding electronic casting a vote for a policy (Khutkyy 2020).

E-referendum – a binding electronic casting a vote about a possible legislative change (Khutkyy 2020).

E-election – a binding electronic casting a vote for electing an official for a public office (Khutkyy 2020).

- Participation (policy implementation)

Crowdsourcing – online collaboration consolidating resources (e.g., ideas or in-kind contributions) for implementing a policy (Khutkyy 2020).

Crowdfunding – online fundraising for implementing a policy (Khutkyy 2020).

Peer-to-peer development – online cooperation for IT development of a software for implementing a policy (Khutkyy 2020).

E-collaboration – online collaboration and coordination of offline activities for implementing a policy (Khutkyy 2020).

- Participation (policy evaluation)

E-Appeal / E-Complaint. In particular public authorities using ICTs to provide citizens with means for complaint, conflict resolution and in combination with other initiatives to establish some citizen relationship management (Krimmer & Kripp 2009).

Open data analytics – an e-tool for online analytics of public data in open format (Khutkyy 2020).

Open data feedback – an e-tool for providing an online feedback on public data in open format (Khutkyy 2020).

E-Journalism. Using electronic and internet tools to publish information and news, report from political (party) events and event blogging by citizens and officials to provide unfiltered information (Krimmer & Kripp 2009).

- Participation (any stage)

Unified participation portal – a website containing two or more participation tools (Khutkyy 2020).

- Accountability

E-reports – online reports by authorities about the results of delivering their duties (Khutkyy 2020).

E-meetings – online meetings of civil servants with the public discussing their performance (Khutkyy 2020).

Performance dashboard – a regularly updated visual representation (with text explanations and quantitative data) of authorities’ performance (Khutkyy 2020).

AI-enabled analytics – a semi- or fully automated analytics of public open data using AI (Khutkyy 2020).

E-tracker – an e-platform checking and reporting to a citizen the status of an inquiry, for instance, a freedom of information request (Khutkyy 2020).

E-audit – an e-platform publishing information about authorities’ compliance with rules in a particular policy area (Khutkyy 2020).

E-oversight – an e-platform for submitting a feedback on authorities’ performance in a particular policy area (Khutkyy 2020).

Unified accountability portal – a website containing two or more accountability tools (Khutkyy 2020).
- **Multiple aspects and stages**

  **Unified e-democracy portal** – a website containing two or more e-democracy aspects (*Khutkyy 2020*).

- **Unclear aspect or stage**

  **Other e-democracy website** – a digital democracy website not fitting any abovementioned category (*Khutkyy 2020*).

  **Transparency aspect**

  **Access to information** is the legal right for citizens to request information from their government, which must be provided unless it falls under a specific exemption in law (*Huss & Keudel 2020*).

  **Open data** is content generated by new technologies to be freely used, modified, and shared by anyone for any purpose. The six principles of the Open Data Charter for the release of data are: open by default, timely and comprehensive, accessible and useable, comparable and interoperable, for improved governance and citizen engagement, and for inclusive development and innovation. (*Huss & Keudel 2020*).

  **Records management** ensures that information is accessible, authentic, comprehensive, and reliable, and therefore underpins both access to information and open data (*Huss & Keudel 2020*).

  **Formal open standard** means a standard which has been laid down in written form, detailing specifications for the requirements on how to ensure software interoperability (*European Parliament & Council of the European Union 2019*).

  **Machine-readable format** means a file format structured so that software applications can easily identify, recognise and extract specific data, including individual statements of fact, and their internal structure (*European Parliament & Council of the European Union 2019*).

  **Open format** means a file format that is platform-independent and made available to the public without any restriction that impedes the re-use of documents (*European Parliament & Council of the European Union 2019*).

  **Accountability aspect**

  **Audits**, both internal and external, are critical to ensuring that public money is appropriately collected, managed, and spent by local government. **Social audits** are conducted by civil society in localities by accessing information from government, engaging with citizens, and reviewing the situation on the ground (*Huss & Keudel 2020*).

  **Codes of ethics** outline what is expected of public servants and provide an important basis for challenging malpractice and corruption in government. Codes of ethics need to be underpinned by clear procedures for complaints, review, and sanctions (*Huss & Keudel 2020*).

  **Scrutiny** ensures that decision-makers are responsive and accountable to residents for their decisions. Scrutiny by elected representatives is further supplemented by scrutiny by residents, civil society, and the media (*Huss & Keudel 2020*).

  **Participation aspect**

  **Civic space** is the freedom and means for individuals and organized groups to speak, access information, associate, organize, and participate in public decision-making (*Huss & Keudel 2020*).

  **Civic engagement** refers to proactive engagement by government with citizens, civil society, and other stakeholder groups at any stage of the policy cycle. It includes informing, consulting, involving, collaborating with, and empowering citizens (*Huss & Keudel 2020*).

  **Whistle-blower protection** relates to the protection of concerned individuals who raise an alarm to stop wrongdoings that place fellow human beings at risk. Their actions provide an opportunity to strengthen accountability and bolster the fight against corruption and mismanagement, both in the public and private sectors (*Huss & Keudel 2020*).
Civic education aspect

**Citizen/citizenship:** The idea of ‘citizenship’ encompasses two notions: the status of being a citizen, “a person co-existing in a society”, and the role, duties and rights that come with being member of a community. It involves issues relating to equality, diversity and social justice. It also includes the range of actions carried out by an individual that impact on the life of the community and thereby require a public sphere for action (*Banda 2009*).

**Civic competence:** This refers to the knowledge and ability acquired by a citizen through education and socialisation to actively take part in public affairs (*Banda 2009*).

**Civic culture:** It refers to that complex whole which consists in the citizens’ civic engagement, political equality, solidarity, trust and tolerance, as well as social structures of cooperation (*Banda 2009*).

**Civic knowledge:** This refers to fundamental ideas and information about public affairs, such as how government operates, legal provisions, human rights, etc., which one needs to know and use to become an affective and responsible citizen of a democracy. Knowledge alone is not enough. When knowledge is mixed with ability or skill, it results in civic competence (*Banda 2009*).

**Civic literacy:** It encompasses a knowledge and understanding of the basic principles of government as well as a basic knowledge and understanding of community processes that are necessary to successfully function within society. It also implies a basic familiarity with the dominant social values and norms and an awareness of current issues that confront the society. Intellectual awareness and an understanding of concepts and ideas form the foundation of civic literacy (*Banda 2009*).

**Civic skills:** These include the intellectual skills needed to understand, explain, compare, and evaluate principles and practices of government and citizenship. They also include participatory skills that enable citizens to monitor and influence public policies (*Banda 2009*).

**Administering institution**

**Civic** – website administered by a civil society organisation (*Khutkyy 2020*).

**Public** – website administered by a public agency (*Khutkyy 2020*).

**References**


